

A-1

**MARICOPA COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT
GOVERNING BOARD RETREAT
JANUARY 15, 2010
MINUTES**

A retreat of the Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board was scheduled to be held at 10:00 a.m. in the Governing Board Room at the District Support Services Center in Tempe, Arizona, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice having been duly given.

PRESENT

GOVERNING BOARD

Randolph Lumm, President
Jerry Walker, Secretary
Don Campbell, Member
Debra Pearson, Member
ABSENT: Colleen Clark, Member

ADMINISTRATION

Rufus Glasper, Chancellor
Lee Combs
Gloria Smith
Teresa Toney

CALL TO ORDER

The retreat was called to order at 10:10 a.m. by Governing Board President Randolph Lumm. Mr. Lumm welcomed everyone to this retreat which would include an opportunity for further discussion of the fine points of the report submitted by the Consulting Team for the HLC Complaint. This retreat (second in a series of three) was to be facilitated by two facilitators representing the Association of Community College Trustees (ACCT), Norm Nielsen and Wayne Newton. Mr. Lumm called upon the Chancellor to provide further opening remarks and comments pertaining to progress made since the first retreat held November 6.

Review Priorities Established/Action Plan From November 6 Retreat

Chancellor Glasper reviewed the priorities and action plan established at the November 6 Retreat. The following information was provided:

- **Review & Revise Board Policies**
 - Board Operations Policy – Rules of Order (adopted in Nov 09)
 - Governance Process – President’s Role (adopted in Dec 09)
 - Civility Statement – Policy Language added to Board Agenda – Research conducted
 - Special Board Meetings – Draft of amendments to three Policies: President’s Role, Annual Board Planning Calendar 2010 & Board Operations
- **Dashboard-Like Monitoring Display**
 - Board Monitoring Report & Presentation – used dashboard to monitor Board goals
 - Dashboard display being developed to assess progress in implementing recommendations of 21st Century Maricopa
- **Method of Improving Board Relationships**
 - Discussion/action at January 15, 2010 Retreat

- **Professional Development**
 - All Board members attending National Legislative Seminar (Feb 2010)
 - Mr. Lumm attending New Trustee Academy (Feb 2010)
 - Mr. Lumm appointed to ACCT Finance & Audit Committee
 - Mrs. Pearson appointed to ACCT Regional Nominating Committee
 - As agreed, board members are reporting on their college visits & meetings
- **Board Self-Assessment**
 - Research completed by staff on other models
 - Next steps–discussion at Jan 15 Retreat
 - Target date for completion: Mar 15
- **Additional Board Retreats are set for:**
 - Board Retreat on Jan 12 – Finance & Budget
 - Board Retreat on Jan 15 – HLC Complaint
 - Board Retreat on Jan 29 – HLC Complaint
- **Good Governance Practices & Ethics Program**
 - Work with ACCT facilitators at Jan 15 & Jan 29 Retreats
 - Target date for completion: Jan 30
- **Succession Plan**
 - Board Officers elected Jan 12
 - Discuss Development of Board Orientation
- **Developing Board Calendar of Meetings/Moving Meetings out of District Office**
 - Board calendar developed & disseminated
 - Board meetings scheduled at campuses with Community Forums planned outside DO

Dr. Nielsen and Mr. Newton asked Board Members and the Chancellor for their assessments of the Board's progress toward resolving outstanding issues. Board President Randolph Lumm rated the progress as 70%. He indicated they were in the early phases of working together. Board Member Jerry Walker rated the progress at 6.5 and stated that the human race by nature is a race in conflict with each other. This is a young board. Personally he was tired of getting dead trees anytime he asked a question. Instead of getting a notebook for something, he wanted someone to provide the answers. If board members learned to communicate better, then they will do a much better job. Board Member Don Campbell estimated the Board progress at 7 on a scale of 1-10. She stated there had been pretentious efforts and some willingness to try. The rhetoric sounds good but there was no depth or much integrity. This District is a well-oiled machine and disagreed with Mr. Walker's comments in that she has never received a dead tree. He stated that board members are beginning to relate better with each other and that they were working for the same purpose and benefit of the taxpayers. Member Debra Pearson rated the progress at 1. The Chancellor rated progress between 3 and 4. He stated the Board was moving in the right direction. He was asking for the Board's support on implementing the A&M Recommendations and thinks he has the support. As we move through the Manner of Governing, he thought this addressed Mr. Walker's recommendations. Portion of the Manner of Governing that he disagrees with is that we should designate a person at the campuses that can answer board members questions. Staff on campuses should not be placed in that position. Board Member Colleen Clark was not in attendance.

Mrs. Pearson: If this does not clarify what the role of a board member is, she stated it didn't matter how old the board was. So long as the board struggles with understanding this, this is not going to accomplish much.

Mr. Newton: Trustees generally are not aware of awesome role of being a board member. They are imposing on Chancellor's responsibility. Board Members must think of it as an hour glass and the Chancellor is that hour glass. A Chancellor or College President could be in a meeting with the Governor or other dignitary, but if a board member is calling, they will place more importance on the board member.

Mrs. Pearson: One things that board members need to understand is that this is a service position, not a position of bullying.

Dr. Campbell: There are always going to be problems with any system that you are involved with. State legislature is a mess; the City has problems; every type of service organization has problems. We need to keep tying to work things out.

Mr. Walker: Not to sound defensive, he is open to criticism. Anyone that says there has been an open meeting violation

Discussion of Manner of Governing Policy Statement

Mr. Newton distributed copies of proposed changes to the existing Manner of Governing Policy. The original policy is shown below. Following this, a copy of the revised version is shown. Finally, a copy of the policy changes moving forward for approval at the January 26, 2010 Governing Board Meeting are shown.

Original Policy with Suggested Changes:

Maricopa Community College *Manner of Governing*

The Board will:

1. Operate in all ways mindful of its civic trusteeship obligation to those who own the organization, the residents of Maricopa County. Board members will attempt to work together, in a harmonious manner, in pursuit of this obligation.
2. Enforce upon itself whatever discipline is needed to govern efficiently, effectively and with excellence. Discipline will apply to matters such as attendance, policy making principles, respect of roles, respect for democratic processes, and ensuring the continuity of governance capability. Continual redevelopment will include orientation of new members in the Board's governance process and periodic Board discussion of the vision, mission and values, outcome development, and public stewardship.

The Board will:

3. Direct, control, and inspire the organization through the careful establishment of organizational policies reflecting the Board's values and perspectives. The Board's major focus will be on, but not limited to, the intended long term impacts outside the operating organization. (*outcomes*).

The Board will:

4. Cultivate a sense of group responsibility. The Board, not the staff, will be responsible for excellence in governing. The Board will be an initiator of policy, not merely a reactor to staff initiatives. The Board will use the expertise of individual members to enhance the ability of the Board as a body, rather than to substitute their individual judgments for the Board's adopted values.

The Board will:

5. Conduct itself in a manner that complies with all relevant laws and regulations. The Board will fulfill all of its legal and fiduciary responsibilities as required by state statutes, the Arizona Constitution, and all state administrative rules. These include responsibilities such as, but not limited to, approval of the budget, tuition and fees, degrees, certificates and diplomas, graduation requirements, curriculum catalog policies and travel regulations and procedures.

The Board will:

6. Keep well-informed about relevant global and local educational and other issues, by actively gathering information and attendance at appropriate workshops and conferences to fulfill its role.

The Board will:

7. Conduct a formal evaluation of the Chancellor in May of each year, to be based on previously agreed upon performance measures. In compliance with A.R.S. #15-1447, this would include a submission by the Chancellor of a complete report of the District and each college campus on the total number of full-time equivalent students enrolled during the year, the actual total number of students, the number of instructors regularly employed and the total number of students not residing within the District. The report shall be submitted at the close of each fiscal year.

The Board will:

8. When requesting any information, must make that request through the Chancellor's office. A Board member may also make a request for information from the Chancellor's designee, who shall coordinate the request with the Chancellor.

The Board will:

9. Govern with appreciation of the diversity of our internal and external communities. Diversity is defined as the environment created within Maricopa that demonstrates equity and mutual respect of each person.

The Board will:

10. Direct that an annual review of board policies begin in July of each year for the purpose of routine maintenance.

The Board will:

11. Monitor and discuss the board's process and performance. Self-monitoring will be conducted annually and will emphasize objective criteria that focus on board efficiency, public stewardship, effectiveness, and attainment of its outcomes.

Revised Version with Agreed-Upon Changes:

Maricopa Community College
Manner of Governing

The Board will:

1. Operate in all ways mindful of its civic trusteeship obligation to those who own the organization, the residents of Maricopa County. Board members will work together, in a harmonious manner, in pursuit of this obligation. *It will conduct the District business in a respectful and civil manner, always mindful of MCCD's public image.*

Suggestion= remove attempt to - done

Suggestion= add as new sentence, It will conduct the District business in a professional manner, always mindful of MCCD's public image.

New language suggestions are in green

Language changes are in red.

Questions are in black.

The Board will:

2. Enforce upon itself whatever discipline is needed to govern efficiently, effectively and with excellence. Discipline will apply to matters such as attendance, policy making principles, respect of roles, respect for democratic processes, and ensuring the continuity of governance capability. Continual redevelopment will include orientation of new members in the Board's governance process and annual affirmation of the Board's vision, mission and values, outcome development, and public stewardship.

Suggestion= Change the word periodic to annually.

The Board will:

12. Direct, control, and inspire the organization through the careful establishment of organizational policies reflecting the Board's values and perspectives. The Board's major focus will be on the intended long term impacts outside the operating organization. *(outcomes), not on the administrative or programmatic means, except as they conflict with statutory law.*

What does this mean? Is it being interpreted as license to micro-manage?

Suggestion= Omit it if it creates confusion.

The Board will:

13. Cultivate a sense of group responsibility. The Board will be responsible for excellence in governing. The Board will be an initiator of policy, not merely a reactor to staff initiatives. The Board will use the expertise of individual members to enhance the ability of the Board as a body, rather than to substitute their individual judgments for the Board's adopted values.

At meeting removed *not the staff* in second sentence.

Suggestion= Can this language be removed? It probably is in conflict with some staff job descriptions.

The last sentence needs clarification.

The Board will:

14. Conduct itself in a manner that complies with all relevant laws and regulations. The Board will fulfill all of its legal and fiduciary responsibilities as required by state statutes, the Arizona Constitution, and all state administrative rules. These include responsibilities such as approval of the budget, tuition and fees, degrees, certificates and diplomas, graduation requirements, curriculum catalog policies and travel regulations and procedures upon recommendation from the Chancellor.

What does this mean? (but not limited to)

Suggestion= Add to last sentence, “upon recommendation from the Chancellor”.

Policy Changes Moving Forward First Reading at the January 26, 2010 Governing Board Meeting are shown.

Manner of Governing

The Board will govern in a manner that is nonpartisan and also balances outward vision with internal concerns. This includes encouraging diversity of viewpoints, and balancing strategic, tactical and administrative leadership styles. While a clear distinction shall be made between Board and Chancellor roles, it is also understood that effective performance requires an amalgam of collective and individual decisions that are both reactive and proactive, mindful of the past, but oriented toward the future.

More specifically, the Board will:

1. Operate in all ways mindful of its civic trusteeship obligation to those who own the organization, the residents of Maricopa County. Board members will ~~attempt to~~ work together, in a harmonious manner, in pursuit of this obligation. **IT WILL CONDUCT THE DISTRICT’S BUSINESS IN A RESPECTFUL AND CIVIL MANNER, ALWAYS MINDFUL OF THE MARICOPA COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT’S PUBLIC IMAGE.**
2. Enforce upon itself whatever discipline is needed to govern efficiently, effectively, and with excellence. Discipline will apply to matters such as attendance, policy making principles, respect of roles, respect for democratic processes, and ensuring the continuity of governance capability. Continual redevelopment will include orientation of new members in the Board's governance process and ~~periodic~~ **ANNUAL** Board discussion of the vision, mission and values, outcome development, and public stewardship **IN ORDER TO REMAIN APPRISED OF THE INSTITUTION’S PROGRESS IN THESE AREAS.**
3. Direct, control, and inspire the organization through the careful establishment of organizational policies reflecting the Board's values and perspectives. The Board's major focus will be on, ~~but not limited to~~, the intended long term impacts outside the

operating organization (*outcomes*), **NOT ON THE ADMINISTRATIVE OR PROGRAMMATIC MEANS, EXCEPT AS THEY CONFLICT WITH STATUTORY LAW.**

4. Cultivate a sense of group responsibility. The Board, ~~not the staff~~, will be responsible for excellence in governing. The Board will be an initiator of policy, not merely a reactor to staff initiatives. The Board will use the expertise of individual members to enhance the ability of the Board as a body, rather than to substitute their individual judgments for the Board's adopted values.
5. Conduct itself in a manner that complies with all relevant laws and regulations. The Board will fulfill all of its legal and fiduciary responsibilities as required by state statutes, the Arizona Constitution, and all state administrative rules. These include responsibilities such as, ~~but not limited to~~, approval of the budget, tuition and fees, degrees, certificates and diplomas, graduation requirements, curriculum catalog policies and travel regulations and procedures **UPON RECOMMENDATION FROM THE CHANCELLOR.**
6. Keep well-informed about relevant global and local educational and other issues, by actively gathering information and attendance at appropriate workshops and conferences to fulfill its role.
7. Conduct a formal evaluation of the Chancellor in May of each year, to be based on previously agreed upon performance measures. In compliance with A.R.S. §15-1447, this would include a submission by the Chancellor of a complete report of the District and each college campus on the total number of full-time equivalent students enrolled during the year, the actual total number of students, the number of instructors regularly employed and the total number of students not residing within the District. The report shall be submitted at the close of each fiscal year.
8. When requesting any information, must make that request through the Chancellor's office. ~~A Board member may also make a request for information from the Chancellor's designee, who shall coordinate the request with the Chancellor.~~ **IN THE CHANCELLOR'S ABSENCE, REQUESTS WILL BE MADE TO THE ACTING CHANCELLOR.**
9. Govern with appreciation of the diversity of our internal and external communities. Diversity is defined as the environment created within Maricopa that demonstrates equity and mutual respect of each person. **OUR GOAL IS TO DEVELOP GOOD CITIZENS WHO ARE WELL-TRAINED AND ABLE TO SUCCEED IN OUR DIVERSE WORLD.**
10. Direct that an annual review of board policies begin in July of each year for the purpose of routine maintenance **AND RELEVANT TO THE BOARD'S LEGAL AND STATUTORY DUTIES, AS WELL AS THE MISSION AND GOALS OF THE DISTRICT.**
11. Monitor and discuss the board's process and performance. Self-monitoring will be conducted annually and will emphasize objective criteria that focus on board efficiency, public stewardship, effectiveness, and attainment of its outcomes.

Concluding Comments:

Dr. Glasper: Statement was made by Mr. Nielsen that Board has never had a meeting where Chancellor was not invited. In his case he was uninvited and CEC were not invited. How should this be answered?

Mr. Walker: Chancellor and CEC are members of the public.

Dr. Nielsen: If you cannot have a meeting with the Chancellor and CEC, something is wrong.

Mr. Newton: Thinking that a lot of ground was covered. On the right track. Share with you how critical to addressing HLC in an appropriate way. Know that they have been affected with you. They have a concern for MCCCCD. Write what is inappropriate. Stay the course. Students are so critical and conduct has to be unapproachable. Understanding where MCCCCD stands at the table. Take this job as seriously as possible and don't toy with biases and prejudices. Human nature being what it is we step off. Observation: Over time there was a process put in place that was acceptable to five people at the table and they were confident that these practices would be perpetuated. And then all of a sudden, you get board members with broader views. Perfect the process and then accommodate these people. Please find whatever answers to get board members back on track. Thinking in terms of how you can get over animosities.

Dr. Nielsen: The only caution is we are only here because of complaint and have been able to use that as leverage. When we come back in two weeks we can put things in place of policy and process, then you can go back to HLC. Where are you going to be one year from now? Very quality programs and faculty and board members need to think about that and get back to credibility and how you are going to accomplish that. Analyze and set some direction.

Mr. Lumm: Thank you for being here and for presentations made.

Dr. Glasper: Commented that staff will review the wording and codify.

Mr. Newton: Working on an agenda to ensure closure of items in consultants' report. They would be interested in whole process. They came because of letter with difficulties (issues). Find way to perfect that. What issues remain so that there aren't any voids.

Dr. Glasper: Take both sessions and fill in those items. For January 26 meeting, we have one items, President's Role. We have one item. Subsequent items will be brought next month.

Mr. Newton: Review with colleagues the process that we went through today.

Adjournment of Retreat: The retreat adjourned at 1:20 p.m.

Jerry Walker
Governing Board Secretary